

## Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

10.00 am Wednesday 30 July 2014

### Present:

Councillors Perry (Convener), Howat (Vice-Convener), Bagshaw, Child, Dixon, Heslop, McVey, Milligan, Mowat, Robson, Rose and Ross.

### 1. General Applications and Miscellaneous Business

---

The Sub-Committee considered the reports on planning applications and pre-applications, listed in Sections 4, 5, 6, 7 and 9 of the agenda for the meeting.

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave presentations on agenda item 4.6 – 4B Gayfield Place as requested by Councillor Mowat, item 4.7 – 107 George Street as requested by Councillor Mowat, Item 4.8 – 1 Hillcoat Loan as requested by Councillor Child, Item 4.11 – King's Buildings Campus as requested by Councillor Rose, Item 4.12 – 8 Muir Wood Grove, Currie as requested by Councillors Helsop, Item 4.14 – 52 Nicolson Street as requested by Councillor Rose and Item 4.19 – 11,13,15,17,19 West Tollcross/20, 22, 24 Lochrin Place as requested by Councillor Bagshaw.

### Decision

To determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

### Dissent

Councillor Heslop requested that his dissent be recorded in respect of the decision on agenda item 4.12 – 8 Muir Wood Grove, Currie.

### 2. Pre-Determination Hearing – 545 Old Dalkeith Road, (Edmonstone Estate), Edinburgh

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application by Sheratan Limited for planning permission in principle for a residential development, ancillary uses and associated development at land 447 metres north east of 545 Old Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh (application no 14/01057/PPP). The application was to be

considered by way of a pre-determination hearing, with a recommendation being submitted to the full Council.

The Sub-Committee received:

- (i) A presentation on the application by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
- (ii) A presentation by the applicant's agent in support of the proposal, a copy of an appeal decision dated 9 October 2013, reference PPA-230-2087 in respect of Edmonstone Estate, Old Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh and a slide showing former mine workings on the site were submitted, as part of the presentation.

**(a) Report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.**

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the application and the planning considerations involved for planning permission in principle.

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards considered that the proposal represented a significant departure from the development plan due to the green belt location, which was not justified in this instance and was also contrary to National Planning Framework 3 in terms of the Central Scotland Green Network.

He explained that housing was not an appropriate green belt use and the housing need was being met through the new local development plan. This proposal would undermine the landscape setting of the city and lead to coalescence with Danderhall.

The proposals would also be detrimental to the character and composition of the local landscape, whilst being contrary to the open space proposal that covered the site. In conclusion there were no material considerations which justified a departure from the development plan.

He recommended that the application for planning permission in principle be refused for the above reasons.

**(b) Presentation by Applicant**

Gordon Steel QC gave a presentation on behalf of the applicant and advised that the appeal decision for the adjacent site which had been was relevant to this application as the greenbelt considerations were the same for this application.

The Local Development Plan (LDP) had proposed several sites within the greenbelt for housing and granting permission for this development would ease the pressure on more sensitive sites identified in the LDP, an example would be Cammo.

This site was unique in regards to greenbelt and did not meet one of the main criteria of public access. This was because it was fenced off due to being considered unsafe as a result of previous underground workings.

The application would be an enabling development with the advantage of rendering the site safe by the stabilisation of the former mine workings.

These would cost in the region of £10 million. It would also allow for the rebuilding of the South Lodge to be undertaken, for which planning and listed building consent had already been granted. It was explained that the developer currently did not have the finance available to carry out the remedial works and these could only be funded through the development.

Reference was made to paragraph 15 of the Notice of Intention by the Reporter which highlighted the shortfall of housing land supply within Edinburgh. Reference was also made to the SESPlan supplementary housing supply guidance, approved by Scottish Ministers which set out the land requirement for the council as 29,510 homes. The applicants stated that the current overall shortfall was approximately 6,000 units and this proposal would help meet this shortfall.

Mr Steel stated that this was the first greenbelt application he was aware of in Edinburgh which had not attracted any public objections and had received no adverse comments at the consultation meetings. He further added that as there had been previous development on the site, the classification of this as a greenbelt development was open to interpretation and that it could be considered that this site was brownfield.

Subsequently, granting consent would not set a precedent for any future greenbelt applications.

In conclusion he asked that the Sub-Committee recommend to the Council that permission be granted.

Copies of representations received during the consultation period were available for the inspection of members of the Sub-Committee and members of the Sub-Committee had the opportunity to visit the site.

Both parties were questioned on their presentations by members of the Sub-Committee.

### **Motion**

To recommend to the Council the application be refused for the reasons:

1. The proposal was contrary to SESPlan Policy 12, Edinburgh City Local Plan Policies Env 10 and Hou 1 and the Second Proposed LDP Policies Env 10 and Hou 1 as there were no compelling reasons to override the strong policy presumption against development in the Green Belt. The housing need was being met through the new Local Development Plan.
2. The proposal was contrary to SESPlan Policy 7 and Edinburgh City Local Plan Policies Des 8 and Env 11 and the Second Proposed LDP Policies Env 7 and Env 11 as the development would not be in keeping with the character of the settlement and local area and would be detrimental to the character and composition of the local landscape.

3. The proposal was contrary to Edinburgh City Local Plan Open Space and Recreation Proposal OSR 4 South East Wedge Parkland and the Second Local Development Plan Greenspace Proposal GS4 South East Wedge Parkland as the development would introduce housing into the area prejudicing the open space designation and the delivery of the strategic green network.
- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Child.

### **Amendment**

1. To recommend to the Council that planning permission be granted.
  2. The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards to submit conditions to be attached to the consent to the Council for approval.
- moved by Councillor Howat, seconded by Councillor Mowat.

### **Voting**

For the motion - 6 votes

For the amendment - 6 votes

The number of votes cast for the Motion and for the Amendment being equal the Convener gave his casting vote in favour of the Motion.

### **Decision**

1. The proposal was contrary to SESPlan Policy 12, Edinburgh City Local Plan Policies Env 10 and Hou 1 and the Second Proposed LDP Policies Env 10 and Hou 1 as there were no compelling reasons to override the strong policy presumption against development in the Green Belt. The housing need was being met through the new Local Development Plan.
2. The proposal was contrary to SESPlan Policy 7 and Edinburgh City Local Plan Policies Des 8 and Env 11 and the Second Proposed LDP Policies Env 7 and Env 11 as the development would not be in keeping with the character of the settlement and local area and would be detrimental to the character and composition of the local landscape.
3. The proposal was contrary to Edinburgh City Local Plan Open Space and Recreation Proposal OSR 4 South East Wedge Parkland and the Second Local Development Plan Greenspace Proposal GS4 South East Wedge Parkland as the development would introduce housing into the area prejudicing the open space designation and the delivery of the strategic green network.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

## **3. Kings Buildings Campus, Edinburgh**

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on the proposed naming of two new streets Marion Ross Road and James Hutton Road within Edinburgh University Campus at Kings Buildings.

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards advised that as unanimous agreement had not been achieved in a consultation with the local Councillors and this required the matter to be referred to the Development management Sub-Committee for determination.

### **Motion**

To agree the proposed street names Marion Ross Road and James Hutton Road, for the new streets within Edinburgh University Campus at Kings Buildings for the reasons detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Howat.

### **Amendment**

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards to request Edinburgh University to review the proposed names Marion Ross and James Hutton for the new streets within Edinburgh University Campus at Kings Buildings

- moved by Councillor Rose, seconded by Councillor Mowat.

### **Voting**

For the motion	-	8 votes
For the amendment	-	3 votes

### **Decision**

To agree the proposed street names Marion Ross Road and James Hutton Road, for the new streets within Edinburgh University Campus at Kings Buildings for the reasons detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

## **4. 52 Nicolson Street , Edinburgh**

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application to install internally illuminated fascia sign and two graphic vinyl panels attached to internal structures at 52 Nicolson Street (Application no. 14/01934/ADV)

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the proposal and the planning considerations involved, and recommended that permission be refused.

### **Motion**

To refuse advertisement consent as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Mowat.

## **Amendment**

1. To indicate that the Sub -Committee was minded to grant advertisement consent
2. The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards to report back on detailed conditions.

- moved by Councillor Rose, seconded by Councillor Howat.

## **Voting**

For the motion - 7 votes

For the amendment - 4 votes

## **Decision**

To refuse advertisement consent as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

## **5. 18 Tennant Street , Edinburgh**

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application to erect residential development of 49 units, comprising of three bedroom mews houses, two bedroom townhouses, and two apartment blocks with a mix of one and two bedroom apartments at 18 Tennant Street (Application no. 13/04405/FUL).

## **Motion**

To continue consideration of the application for a site visit.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Ross.

## **Amendment**

To consider and determine the application to erect residential development of 49 units, comprising of three bedroom mews houses, two bedroom townhouses, and two apartment blocks with a mix of one and two bedroom apartments (Application no. 13/04405/FUL).

- moved by Councillor Howat, seconded by Councillor Ross.

## **Voting**

For the motion - 9 votes

For the amendment - 2 votes

## **Decision**

To continue consideration of the application for a site visit.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

## 6. 545 Old Dalkeith Road (Land 447 Metres Northeast of) (Edmonstone Estate, Edinburgh)

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application for a Cemetery (including provision for woodland burials), Memorial Garden, Chapel of Rest and associated development (Application no. 13/05235/PPP).

The Convener advised that in order to allow due consideration of the proposals he was of the opinion that the application should be continued to the next meeting of the Sub-Committee on 13 August 2014 and in terms of Standing Order 8.1(b) instructed that a vote be taken for and against continuation.

### **Motion**

To continue consideration of the application to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Child.

### **Voting**

For the proposal - 7 votes

Against the proposal - 4 votes

### **Decision**

To continue consideration of the matter to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

## 7. 545 Old Dalkeith Road (Land 447 Metres Northeast of) (Edmonstone Estate, Edinburgh)

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application for a Cemetery, Crematorium, Memorial Garden, Chapel of Rest and associated development (Application no. 13/05302/PPP).

The Convener advised that in order to allow due consideration of the proposals he was of the opinion that the application should be continued to the next meeting of the Sub-Committee on 13 August 2014 and in terms of Standing Order 8.1(b) instructed that a vote be taken for and against continuation.

### **Motion**

To continue consideration of the matter to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Child.

### **Voting**

For the proposal - 7 votes

Against the proposal - 4 votes

**Decision**

To continue consideration of the matter to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)



## APPENDIX

### Applications

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision (This may not be the final minute wording)
<p><b>Note:</b> Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decision are contained in the statutory planning register.</p>		
<p>Item 4.1 - 3 Back Dean Edinburgh</p>	<p>Removal of conservatory and addition of patio doors and external stair over new bay window to south elevation. Minor alterations to fenestration of east elevation and addition of east elevation and addition of 1.2 m satellite dish – application no. 14/01563/FUL</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p>Item 4.2 - Balmwell Terrace Edinburgh</p>	<p>Stopping Up Order</p>	<p>To <b>CONFIRM</b> the Order.</p>
<p>Item 4.3 - 8 Cramond Bridge (Cobble Cottage Cramond Ferry) Edinburgh_</p>	<p>Provision of east and west bank infrastructure for the Cramond chain ferry, lift platform, support structure, floating pontoon and ferry dock (as amended) – application no. 12/02406/FUL</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reasons and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p>Item 4.4 - East Princes Street Gardens Princess Street Edinburgh</p>	<p>Erection of a big wheel with associated box office and ancillary facilities – application no. 14/02334/FUL</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reasons and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision (This may not be the final minute wording)
Item 4.5 - Eastfield Road (Land 132 Metres Northwest of 100 Eastfield Road) Edinburgh	Erect 600 mm high aluminium advert circling two illuminated golf clubs and a golf ball on a tee - application no. 14/FUL/02220/ADV	To <b>GRANT</b> advertisement consent subject to a condition, reason and an informative as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Item 4.6 - 4b Gayfield Place Edinburgh	Change of use from office accommodation to guesthouse/B&B – application no 14/01197/FUL	To <b>CONTINUE</b> for <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Further details of the proposed use whether it would operate as an HMO or Hostel</li> <li>2. An assessment on residential amenity</li> <li>3. Further information of the number of occupants and proposed management.</li> <li>4. Transportation to reassess the application in regard to parking provision in the area.</li> </ol>
Item 4.7 - 107 George Street Edinburgh	Proposed sub-division and change of use of upper and lower basement floors from existing retail use (Class 1) to restaurant (Class 3) – application no. 14/01522/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reason and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Item 4.8 - 1 Hillcoat Loan Edinburgh	Erection of a metal container type shed – application no. 14/00389/FUL	To <b>CONTINUE</b> for a site visit
Item 4.9 - Hyvot Gardens Hyvot Terrace Edinburgh	Stopping Up Order	To <b>CONFIRM</b> the Order.
Item 4.10 - 100 Jubilee Road Edinburgh	Apply 2 proposed 7mx 14m vinyls to stairwells and 52m x 9m mesh adverts on the western elevation of the multi-storey car park – application no. 14/02064/ADV	To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to a condition and reason as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision (This may not be the final minute wording)
Item 4.11 - Kings Buildings Campus Edinburgh	Proposed naming of new streets within Edinburgh University Campus at Kings Buildings	To <b>AGREE</b> the proposed renaming. (On a division)
Item 4.12 - 8 Muir Wood Grove Currie	Build single storey extension to side of house with projection to front – application no. 14/01879/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to informatics as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.  Councillor Heslop asked that his dissent be noted in regard to the above decision
Item 4.13 - 181 Newhaven Road (Trinity Primary School) Edinburgh	Extension to existing dining hall. Replacement of curtain wall to one classroom following reduction of structural opening width. Replacement of existing window with door to provide additional access to courtyard from adjacent cloakroom – application no. 14/01940/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to informatics as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Item 4.14 - 52 Nicolson Street Edinburgh	Install internally illuminated fascia sign and 2 graphic vinyl panels attached to internal structures – application no. 14/01934/ADV	To <b>REFUSE</b> advertisement consent as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standard and authorise. (On a division)
Item 4.15 - Queensferry Road Kirkliston (At Land Adjacent to)	Planning Application under Section 42 of the planning act to increase total number of residential units from 680 to 720 – application no. 14/01283/PPP	To <b>GRANT</b> the application subject to informatics and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision (This may not be the final minute wording)
Item 4.16 - Queensferry Road Kirkliston (Land Adjacent To) 14/01280/AMCc	Approval of Matters specified in Conditions for residential development of 40 homes at Area A, Kirkliston – application no. 14/01280/AMC	To <b>GRANT</b> the application subject to a condition, reason and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Item 4.17 - Queensferry Road Kirkliston (Land Adjacent To) 14/01708/AMC	Approval of Matters Specified in Conditions for development of 75 dwelling houses and associated roads, paths, walls, fences, soft and hard landscaping – application no. 14/01708/AMC	To <b>GRANT</b> the application subject to a condition, reason and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Item 4.18 - 1 Wemyss Place Edinburgh (Land 15 Metres East of)	Permission to allow the Air Quality Monitoring Station at the junction of Wemyss Place and Queen Street to remain at this site for a further period of two years – application no. 14/01424/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to a condition, reason and informative as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Item 4.19 - 11, 13, 15, 17, 19 West Tollcross 20, 22, 24 Lochrin Place Edinburgh	Financial obligations as noted on the Section 75 Agreement between The City of Edinburgh Council and Teague Developments Ltd - registered on 16/08/05 - application no. 14/01143/OBL	To <b>CONTINUE</b> for <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Further details of the charges on the properties and potential costs the authority would incur in recovering the contribution</li> <li>2. Further information on the potential to recover part of the contributions</li> <li>3. Details of systems now in place to monitor Section 75 agreements</li> <li>4. Further information of why the Transportation contribution is no longer required</li> </ol>

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision (This may not be the final minute wording)
Item 5.1 - 35 Warriston Crescent Edinburgh	Construct a full-sized (36.6m x 18.3m) tarmacadam tennis court and an adjoining mini-tennis court (17m x 8.5m), in the south-east corner of the Warriston Playing Fields (as amended) – application no 13/02168/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> the application subject to a condition, reason and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Item 6.1 - Protocol Note	Protocol Note	
Item 6.2 - 545 Old Dalkeith Road (Land 447 Metres South East of Edmonstone Estate)	Residential development, ancillary uses and associated development - application no 14/01057/PPP	To recommend to the Council meeting on 21 August 2014 to <b>REFUSE</b> planning permission as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standard and authorise.  (On a division)
Item 7.1 - 52 Annandale Street Edinburgh	Report on forthcoming application by JLL for residential development – reference no. 14/02658/PAN	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) To note the key issues at this stage.</li> <li>2) Further information on infrastructure capacity</li> <li>3) An assessment of the suitability of residential development next to the bus garage taking into account noise and disturbance due to its 24 hour operation</li> </ol>
Item 7.2 - 34b Haddington Place Edinburgh	Report on forthcoming application by S Harrison Developments Limited for a mixed use development comprising student accommodation, retail, gym, café and restaurant uses – reference no. 14/02115/PAN	<b>CONTINUE</b> to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision (This may not be the final minute wording)
Item 7.3 - Lang Loan Edinburgh	Report on forthcoming application by Geddes Consulting for the development of a greenfield site for housing – reference no. 14/02056/PAN	<b>CONTINUE</b> to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014
Item 7.4 - 151 London Road Edinburgh	Report on forthcoming application by Caledonia Trust PLC for renewal of planning permission in principle application 09/01793/PPP for 21,500SQM of mixed use development including residential, retail/commercial, hotel & student accommodation – reference no. 14/02137/PAN	<b>CONTINUE</b> to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014
Item 7.5 - Portobello High Street (Baileyfield) Edinburgh	Report on forthcoming application by GVA James Barr for mixed use development comprising housing and foodstore – reference no. 14/02185/PAN	<b>CONTINUE</b> to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014
Item 7.6 - Queensferry Road Edinburgh	Report on forthcoming application by Erskine Stewart Melville schools for demolition of existing junior school buildings (Belford, Beuly, Pentland and Extension to Wallace Dunlop Hall) to be replaced by new build 2 storey teaching building and extension to Reid House – reference no. 14/01367/PAN	To note the key issues at this stage.

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision (This may not be the final minute wording)
Item 7.7 - 3-8 St Andrew Square 7-21 South St David Street Edinburgh	Report on forthcoming application by Standard Life Assurance Ltd for Mixed Use Development – reference no. 14/02836/PAN	<b>CONTINUE</b> to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014
Item 7.8 - 102 St Leonard's Street Edinburgh	Report on forthcoming application by the UNITE Group plc. for demolition of the existing building and development of a mixed use development comprising student accommodation, retail and associated facilities – reference no. 14/00885/PAN	<b>CONTINUE</b> to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014
Item 9.1 - 545 Old Dalkeith Road (Land 447 Metres Northeast of Edmonstone Estate) Edinburgh	Cemetery (including provision for woodland burials), Memorial Garden, Chapel of Rest and associated development – application no. 13/05235/PPP	<b>CONTINUE</b> to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014 (On a division)
Item 9.2 - 545 Old Dalkeith Road (At Land 447 Metres Northeast of Edmonstone Estate) Edinburgh	Cemetery, Crematorium, Memorial Garden, Chapel of Rest and associated development – application no. 13/05302/PPP	<b>CONTINUE</b> to the meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 13 August 2014 (On a division)

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision (This may not be the final minute wording)
Item 9.3 - 18 Tennant Street Edinburgh	Erect residential development of 49 units, comprising of 3 bedroom mews houses, 2 bedroom townhouses, and two apartment blocks with a mix of one and two bedroom apartments – application no. 13/04405/FUL	To <b>CONTINUE</b> for a site visit (On a division



# Minutes

## Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

10.00 am Wednesday 13 August 2014

### Present:

Councillors Perry (Convener), Howat (Vice-Convener), Bagshaw, Brock, Cairns, Child, Dixon, Heslop, McVey, Milligan, Mowat, Robson and Ross.

### 1. General Applications and Miscellaneous Business

---

The Sub-Committee considered the reports on planning applications and pre-applications, listed in Sections 4, 7, 8 and 9 of the agenda for the meeting.

A request to consider agenda item 4.3 (19 Dean Park Crescent) by holding a hearing session had been received from Councillor Barrie.

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave presentations on agenda item 4.1 – 1 Abinger Gardens as requested by Councillor Ross, item 4.2 – 275 Dalkeith Road as requested by Councillor Dixon, Item 4.3 – 19 Dean Park Crescent as requested by Councillors Bagshaw and Rose, Item 4.4 – 31 Echline Grove, South Queensferry as requested by Councillors Bagshaw and Ross, Item 4.7 – 2 Lochside Place as requested by Councillor Bagshaw, Item 4.8 – 24 Royal Terrace as requested by Councillor Mowat and Item 8.2 – 18 Tennant Street as requested by Councillor Brock.

### Decision

To determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

### 2. 275 Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application for planning permission for a change of use to a 5 Bedroom, 6 person House in Multiple Occupation at 3F2 275 Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh (application no 14/01969/FUL).

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the proposal and the planning considerations involved, and recommended that planning permission be granted.

## **Motion**

To grant planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in Section 3 of the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Heslop.

## **Amendment**

- 1) To indicate that the Sub -Committee was minded to refuse planning permission for the reason that the proposed development constituted an inappropriate use in a residential area in terms of Policy Hou 8 and would have a detrimental effect on the amenity and living conditions of neighbouring residents .
- 2) To ask the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards to report back to a future meeting of the Sub-Committee with detailed reasons for refusal.

moved by Councillor Dixon, seconded by Councillor Bagshaw.

## **Voting**

- |                   |   |         |
|-------------------|---|---------|
| For the motion    | - | 9 votes |
| For the amendment | - | 4 votes |

## **Decision**

To grant planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in Section 3 of the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted)

## **3. 19 Dean Park Crescent, Edinburgh**

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application to erect a single storey extension and form a new window to the rear with decking at 19 Dean Park Crescent, Edinburgh (application no 13/05041).

### **(a) Request for a Hearing**

Councillor Gavin Barrie, local member, had submitted a request that the Sub-Committee determine the application by way of a hearing.

#### **Motion**

To agree to hold a hearing.

- moved by Councillor Ross, seconded by Councillor Cairns.

#### **Amendment**

Not to hold a hearing and to proceed to consider the application at this meeting.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Howat.

#### **Voting**

- |                   |   |          |
|-------------------|---|----------|
| For the motion    | - | 2 votes  |
| For the amendment | - | 11 votes |

## **Decision**

Not to hold a hearing and proceed to consider the application at this meeting.

### **(b) Report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards**

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the proposal and the planning considerations included and recommended that planning permission be granted.

## **Decision**

To continue consideration of the application for a site visit.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted)

## **4. 545 Old Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh (Land 447 Metres Northeast of)**

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application for planning permission in principle for a Cemetery (including provision for woodland burials), Memorial Garden, Chapel of Rest and associated development on land 447 metres northeast of 545 Old Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh (application no 13/05235/PPP).

On 30 July 2014, the Sub-Committee had continued the application to this meeting for consideration.

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the proposal and the planning considerations involved, and recommended that planning permission in principle be refused.

## **Motion**

To refuse planning permission for the reasons detailed in section 3 of the report by the Acting Head of Planning

- moved by Councillor Child, seconded by Councillor Bagshaw

## **Amendment**

To indicate that the Sub-Committee was minded to grant planning permission and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.

- moved by Councillor Howat, seconded by Councillor Perry.

## **Voting**

For the motion	-	4 votes
For the amendment	-	7 votes

## **Decision**

To indicate that the Sub-Committee was minded to grant planning permission and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted)

## 5. 545 Old Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh (Land 447 Metres Northeast Of)

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application for planning permission in principle for a Cemetery, Crematorium, Memorial Garden, Chapel of Rest and associated development on land 447 metres northeast of 545 Old Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh (application no 13/05302/PPP).

On 30 July 2014, the Sub-Committee had continued the application to this meeting for consideration.

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the proposal and the planning considerations involved, and recommended that planning permission in principle be refused.

### **Motion**

To refuse planning permission in principle for the reasons detailed in section 3 of the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

- moved by Councillor Child, seconded by Councillor Bagshaw.

### **Amendment**

To indicate that the Sub-Committee was minded to grant planning permission and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.

- moved by Councillor Howat, seconded by Councillor Perry

### **Voting**

For the motion	-	4 votes
For the amendment	-	7 votes

### **Decision**

To indicate that the Sub-Committee was minded to grant planning permission and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted)

## Applications

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p><b>Note:</b> Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decision are contained in the statutory planning register.</p>		
<p>Item 4.1 1 Abinger Gardens, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Create a gated opening and driveway in the garden to the side of the property with the opening and access from Murrayfield Gardens. The gate will be of metal frame and wood construction with a hard standing of recycled cobbles.</p> <p>(application no 14/02192/FUL)</p>	<p>1) To indicate that the Sub-Committee is <b>MINDÉD TO REFUSE</b> planning permission for the reason that the proposed development would have an adverse impact on the character and visual amenity of the conservation area.</p> <p>2) That the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting of the Sub-Committee with detailed reasons for refusal.</p>
<p>Item 4.2 275 Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Change of use to 5 bedroom (6 person) HMO flat</p> <p>(application no 14/01969/FUL)</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in Section 3 of the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p> <p>(on a division – see minute item 2)</p>
<p>Item 4.3 19 Dean Park Crescent, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Erect a single storey extension and form new window to the rear with decking</p> <p>(application no 13/05041/FUL)</p>	<p>To <b>CONTINUE</b> consideration of the application for a site visit.</p>

<p>Item 4.4 31 Echline Grove, South Queensferry</p>	<p>Change of use of small section of amenity open space to private garden. Area will be fenced off from the remaining area of amenity open space by the erection of a new 1.8m hit and miss timber fence (as amended) (application no 14/01350/FUL)</p>	<p>To <b>CONTINUE</b> consideration of the application for further information on the percentage of amenity open space still remaining compared with what had been agreed as part of the original housing development planning consent.</p>
<p>Item 4.5 2 Goosander Place, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Erection of 96 residential units (application no 14/01150/AMC)</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reasons and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p>Item 4.6 Queensferry Road, Kirkliston</p>	<p>Planning application under section 42 of the planning act seeks to vary condition 1 of the outline planning permission to extend period for further AMC applications to end of May 2015 (application no 14/01737/PPP)</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reasons, informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p>Item 4.7 Lochside Place, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Renewal of previous planning application (09/00753/FUL) for change of use from health and fitness club to commercial offices (application no 14/01891/FUL)</p>	<p>1) To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reasons, informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards. 2) To agree to retain the condition contained in the original planning permission relating to the £40,000 developer contribution.</p>

<p>Item 4.8 24 Royal Terrace, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Alterations to modernise hotel accommodation including removal of the rear fire escape stair  (application no 14/02026/FUL)</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p>Item 4.9 1-3 Rutland Street, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Proposed outdoor seating area with enclosure (as amended)  (application no 14/01524/FUL)</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reasons and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p>Item 7.1 34B Haddington Place, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by S Harrison Developments Limited for a mixed use development comprising student accommodation, retail, gym, cafe and restaurant uses  (reference no 14/02115/PAN)</p>	<p>1) To note the key issues at this stage.  2) Further information asked for on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Designated garden inventory sites in the New Town</li> <li>• Data zones</li> <li>• Concentration of student accommodation</li> </ul>
<p>Item 7.2 Lang Loan, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by Geddes Consulting for the development of a greenfield site for housing  (reference no 14/02115/PAN)</p>	<p>To note the key issues at this stage.</p>
<p>Item 7.3 151 London Road, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by Caledonia Trust plc for renewal of planning permission in principle application 09/01793/PPP for 21,500 sqm of mixed use development including residential, retail/commercial, hotel and student accommodation  (reference no 14/02185/PAN)</p>	<p>1) To note the key issues at this stage.  2) Further information asked for on existing community use as artists' studios.</p>

<p>Item 7.4 Portobello High Street (Baileyfield), Edinburgh</p>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by GVA James Barr for mixed use development comprising housing and foodstore  (reference no 14/02185/PAN)</p>	<p>1) To note the key issues at this stage.  2) Further information asked for on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• how the housing and foodstore proposed uses are provided for elsewhere in the locality</li> <li>• the impact of the proposals on the existing cottages</li> </ul>
<p>Item 7.5 3-8 St Andrews Square/ 7-21 South St David's Street, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by Standard Life Assurance Ltd for mixed use development  (reference no 14/02836/PAN)</p>	<p>1) To note the key issues at this stage.  2) Further information asked for on the potential to hold a design competition for this site to ensure sufficient quality of design to enhance the Square.</p>
<p>Item 7.6 102 St Leonards Street, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by the UNITE Group plc for demolition of the existing building and development of a mixed use development comprising student accommodation, retail and associated facilities  (reference no 14/02129/PAN)</p>	<p>1) To note the key issues at this stage.  2) Further information asked for on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the immediate data zone and beyond to ascertain the student population and the impact of the proposed development on surrounding areas</li> <li>• other planning applications for student accommodation</li> </ul>



<p>Item 8.1 1 Hillcoat Loan, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Erection of a metal container type shed (application no 14/00389/FUL)</p>	<p>1) To indicate that the Sub-Committee is <b>MINDED TO REFUSE</b> planning permission for the reasons that the scale and design of the development would have a detrimental impact on the amenity of neighbouring residents and have an adverse effect on the character of the area.</p> <p>2) That the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting of the Sub-Committee with detailed reasons for refusal.</p>
<p>Item 8.2 18 Tennant Street, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Erect residential development of 49 units, comprising of 3 bedroom mews houses, 2 bedroom townhouses, and two apartment blocks with a mix of one and two bedroom apartments (application no 13/04405/FUL)</p>	<p>1) To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reasons, informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p> <p>2) That the tram contribution from the developer be discussed as part of the Section 75 legal agreement negotiations but to agree that a contribution of no less than £10,000 would be acceptable.</p>

<p>Item 9.1 545 Old Dalkeith Road (Land 447 Metres Northeast of) (Edmonstone Estate, Edinburgh)</p>	<p>Cemetery (including provision for woodland burials), memorial garden, chapel of rest and associated development (application no 13/05235/PPP)</p>	<p>To indicate that the Sub-Committee is <b>MINDED TO GRANT</b> planning permission and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting of the Sub-Committee with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.  (on a division - see minute item 4 above)</p>
<p>Item 9.2 545 Old Dalkeith Road (at Land 447 Metres Northeast of) (Edmonstone Estate, Edinburgh)</p>	<p>Cemetery, crematorium, memorial garden, chapel of rest and associated development (application no 13/05302/PPP)</p>	<p>To indicate that the Sub-Committee is <b>MINDED TO GRANT</b> planning permission and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting of the Sub-Committee with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.  (on a division – see minute item 5 above)</p>

# Minutes

## Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

10.00 am Wednesday 27 August 2014

### Present:

Councillors Perry (Convener), Howat (Vice-Convener), Bagshaw, Blacklock, Brock, Cairns, Child, McVey, Milligan, Mowat, Robson, Rose and Ross.

### 1. General Applications and Miscellaneous Business

---

The Sub-Committee considered the reports on planning applications and pre-applications, listed in Sections 4, 5, 6, and 9 of the agenda for the meeting.

#### Decision

To determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

### 2. 142 Lothian Road, Edinburgh

---

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on two applications for planning permission and listed building consent for the partial demolition of the existing building, erection of a replacement new mixed use extension comprising retail, offices, plant, basement parking and associated works – application nos. 14/01056/FUL and 14/01051/LBC

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the proposal and the planning considerations involved, and recommended that planning permission and listed building consent be refused.

#### Motion

To indicate that the Sub-Committee was minded to grant planning permission and listed building consent and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting of the Sub-Committee with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Rose.



## **Amendment**

To refuse planning permission and listed building consent for the reasons detailed in of the reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

- moved by Councillor Bagshaw, seconded by Councillor Brock.

## **Voting**

For the motion - 10 votes  
For the amendment - 3 votes

## **Decision**

To indicate that the Sub-Committee was minded to grant planning permission and listed building consent and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting of the Sub-Committee with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.

(Reference – reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted)

## **3. 51 Little France Crescent (Edinburgh Royal Infirmary), Edinburgh**

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application for the Approval of matters specified in condition 1 of application 11/02454/PPP covering siting, design and height of the buildings, design of external spaces, details of car and cycle parking, details of road layouts, footpaths and cycle routes, hard and soft landscaping details, SUDS details, sustainability, lighting, noise and air quality for the erection of a new Royal Hospital for Sick Children, Children's Accident and Emergency Dept, Dept of Clinical Neurosciences, and Children and Adult Mental Health Service Unit. Works included energy centre, service yard, disabled, parent and child parking, hard and soft landscaping and external landscaped courtyards – application no. 14/01796/AMC

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the proposal and the planning considerations involved, and recommended approval of he application.

## **Motion**

To approve the application subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives as detailed in report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

- moved by Councillor Rose, seconded by Councillor Howat.

## **Amendment**

To continue consideration of the matter for further discussions on the possible relocation of the service yard.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Robson.

## **Voting**

For the motion - 8 votes  
For the amendment - 5 votes

**Decision**

To approve the application subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted)

## APPENDIX

### Applications

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p><b>Note:</b> Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decision are contained in the statutory planning register.</p>		
<p><a href="#">Item No 4.1 - 13</a> <a href="#">Clermiston Road North</a> <a href="#">(Land 58 Metres</a> <a href="#">Northeast of)</a> <a href="#">Edinburgh</a></p>	<p>Erection of new detached dwelling house – application no. 13/04788/FUL</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p><a href="#">Item No 4.2 - 1</a> <a href="#">Craigpark Ratho</a> <a href="#">Craigpark Quarry</a></p>	<p>The erection of an agricultural storage shed and manager's residence on land to be developed as a country park– application no. 14/02128/FUL</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reasons, informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p><a href="#">Item No 4.3 - 1d</a> <a href="#">Pennywell Gardens</a> <a href="#">Edinburgh</a></p>	<p>Demolition of existing 2 buildings on site, formation of new road linking Pennywell Gardens/Muirhouse Crescent and new parking on Pennywell Gardens. Reconfigured access to service yard on Pennywell Road and access to new car park. New 3 storey building providing GP and Primary Care facilities with associated support and office accommodation on plot N5 of the consented masterplan of application 12/00966/PPP – application no. 14/02250/AMC</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p><a href="#">Item No 4.4 -</a> <a href="#">Simpson Loan</a> <a href="#">Edinburgh</a></p>	<p>Stopping Up Order</p>	<p>To <b>CONFIRM</b> the Order</p>

<a href="#">Item No 5.1 - 4b</a> <a href="#">Gayfield Place</a> <a href="#">Edinburgh</a>	Change of use from office accommodation to guesthouse/B&B – application no 14/01197/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to an informative and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
<a href="#">Item 6.1 (a) – 142</a> <a href="#">Lothian Road,</a> <a href="#">Edinburgh</a>	Partial demolition of the existing building, erection of a replacement new mixed use extension comprising retail, offices, plant, basement parking and associated works – application no. 14/01056/FUL	To indicate that the Sub-Committee was <b>MINDED TO GRANT</b> planning permission and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting of the Sub-Committee with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.  (On a division)
<a href="#">Item No 6.1(b) - 142</a> <a href="#">Lothian Road</a> <a href="#">Edinburgh</a>	Partial demolition and replacement of later extensions with new mixed-use development (as amended) – application no. 14/01051/LBC	To indicate that the Sub-Committee was <b>MINDED TO GRANT</b> listed building consent and that the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards report back to a future meeting of the Sub-Committee with detailed conditions, reasons and informatives as appropriate.  (On a division)

<p><a href="#">Item No 6.2 - 51</a>  <a href="#">Little France</a>  <a href="#">Crescent Edinburgh</a>  <a href="#">(Royal Infirmary)</a></p>	<p>Approval of matters specified in condition 1 of application 11/02454/PPP covering siting, design and height of the buildings, design of external spaces, details of car and cycle parking, details of road layouts, footpaths and cycle routes, hard and soft landscaping details, SUDS details, sustainability, lighting, noise and air quality for the erection of a new Royal Hospital for Sick Children, Children's Accident and Emergency Dept, Dept of Clinical Neurosciences, and Children and Adult Mental Health Service Unit. Works include energy centre, service yard, disabled, parent and child parking, hard and soft landscaping and external landscaped courtyards – application no. 14/01796/AMC</p>	<p>To <b>APPROVE</b> the application subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.  (On a division)</p>
<p>Item no 6.3 – 51  Little France  Crescent (Edinburgh  Royal Infirmary)  Edinburgh</p>	<p>Landscape and parking proposals on the site of the former creche and petrol filling station associated with the re-provision– application no. 14/01797/FUL</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> planning permission subject to conditions, reasons, informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards</p>
<p>Item No 6.4 –  Greendykes Road  (Land At) Edinburgh</p>	<p>Residential development comprising 145 private residential units, part of Greendykes Masterplan Site areas C and D associated with planning application reference 12/01109/AMC</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> the application subject to conditions, reasons, informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards</p>



<p>Item No 6.5 - 20 Mansionhouse Road, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Hard and soft landscape works include new metal railings and gates to the street frontage, masonry boundary wall repairs, alterations to the existing vehicular access driveway including new surface finish and extents and several tree removals– application no. 14/02371/FUL</p>	<p>To <b>CONTINUE</b> consideration of the application for</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Further information on the percentage increase above guidelines to the hard landscaping</li> <li>2) To ask the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards to discuss with the applicant a possible reduction in the area of hardstanding.</li> </ol>
<p>Item No 6.6 - 2 Sciennes Gardens, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Single storey flat roof (with glass cupola) extension to rear of property. Install velux windows in existing roof. Form driveway hardstanding for off-street parking for one car – application no. 14/02148/FUL</p>	<p>To note the report had been withdrawn from the agenda at the request of the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards</p>

<a href="#">Item No 9.1 - 25 Brunswick Road (Site 157 Metres West Of) Edinburgh</a>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by CALA Management and Atilla (BR) Limited for residential development with commercial element – reference no. 14/02529/PAN</p>	<p>1) To note the key issues at this stage.</p> <p>2) Further information asked for on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The level of family housing to be incorporated in the development</li> <li>• Play areas and open recreational space incorporated into the development and its interaction with the level of proposed car parking space</li> <li>• Density of the development</li> <li>• The level of car parking needed to be provided considering the level of public transport available in the surrounding area</li> <li>• To advise the applicant of the need for a creative design for the site having reference to the decision taken on the previous application for the site.</li> </ul>
<a href="#">Item No 9.2 - 4 Ferry Muir (Site 80 Metres West Of) South Queensferry</a>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by Bellway Homes for a residential development and community facility – reference no. 14/02623/PAN</p>	<p>1) To note the key issues at this stage.</p> <p>2) Further information asked for on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The reasons for a purely residential development and not mixed uses</li> <li>• Education, Health and transport requirements for the development</li> </ul>
<a href="#">Item No 9.3 - 3 Harlaw Gait (Land 190 Metres North Of) Balerno</a>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by Bellway Homes for a residential development and community facility – reference no. 14/02623/PA</p>	<p>To note the report had been withdrawn from the agenda at the request of the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>

## Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

10.00 am, Wednesday, 3 September 2014

### Present

Councillors Perry (Convener), Howat (Vice-Convener), Bagshaw, Blacklock, Brock, Cairns, Child, Dixon, Heslop, McVey, Milligan, Mowat, Robson, Rose and Ross.

### 1. Napier University Craighouse Campus, Edinburgh

---

The Sub-Committee had agreed to hold a hearing for consideration of the following three applications at Napier University Craighouse Campus, Craighouse Road, Edinburgh:

1. Proposed change of use and conversion of existing buildings from university campus to residential, construction of new build residential with ancillary development, public realm, utilities infrastructure, access roads, car parking, landscaping - Application no. 12/04007/SCH3;
2. Proposed conversion of existing listed buildings at New Craig, Queen's Craig, East Craig, Bevan Villa, South Craig, Craighouse Lodge, Old Craighouse to form residential properties, including extension at South Craig and demolition of Boiler House (as amended) - Application no. 12/04007/LBC;
3. Demolition of Learning Resource Centre (LRC) Building - Application no. 12/04007/CON

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on the applications for planning permission, listed building and conservation area consents. He gave details of the proposals and the planning considerations included and concluded that while the proposals were contrary to numerous policies, the application was for an enabling development and it had been demonstrated that the proposed quantum of development was the minimum necessary to fund the long term future use of the category A listed buildings and the surrounding landscape. The significance of the public benefits, which crucially not only ensured the long term future of these buildings but retained public access to this historic place to the benefit of the wider community, outweighed the more moderate disbenefits of allowing development contrary to policy. There were no other material considerations and recommended that planning permission, listed building and conservation area consents be granted.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/1770000](http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/1770000)

**(a) David Owen and Nick Honhold – Craiglockhart Community Council**

David Owen and Nick Honhold, on behalf of Craiglockhart Community Council, advised that their objections were consistent with the previous objections from the Craiglockhart community that had been voiced at previous consultations. Nick Honhold stressed that the application was detrimental to the environment, setting and community of Craiglockhart and that these objections had been voiced by the majority of local residents in the area. Nick Honhold outlined the physical visual impact the application would have and the detrimental nature of the development to the surrounding environment in Craiglockhart. It was highlighted that alternative uses had not been put forward or examined and that the minimum level of development that was proposed and the levels of profit for the developer had not been fully scrutinised. A graphical representation showing the size of the buildings was presented and compared to the existing buildings on the site. A number of environmental issues were highlighted including issues that would affect bats, badgers, grasslands and birds negatively.

In conclusion it was asked that the members take into consideration the views of the residents of the area, the environmental issues that the development would have and the physical impact the buildings would have next to the listed buildings and requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/5158000](http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/5158000)

**(b) Marianna Clyde – Merchiston Community Council**

Marianna Clyde, on behalf of the Merchiston Community Council, advised that the application was unsympathetic in design to the surrounding area, highlighted the impact on landscape and setting in the area and stated the development contravened a number of English Heritage and City of Edinburgh Council planning policies. The presentation went on to describe the importance of greenspaces within a city and the benefits these spaces can bring to a community. The speaker demonstrated the high density of properties in the area and the importance of Craighouse place in acting as a greenspace for the local community with the associated physical and mental health benefits. Graphics of the plans were shown and it was demonstrated how this conflicted with the environment and design of the landscape.

In conclusion it was stated that in their opinion the application had a detrimental effect to the area, was contrary to a number of planning policies and that a more suitable community proposal existed and requested that the applications should be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/6211000](http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/6211000)

**(c) Goff Cantley and Andrew Richards – Morningside Community Council**

Goff Cantley and Andrew Richards, Morningside Community Council advised that there was an overwhelming rejection of the proposed application from the Morningside community. The presentation highlighted the specials protections that Craighouse was subject to. Goff Cantley stated that development of the existing buildings on the site transformed into residential or mixed use accommodations would be welcomed in an effort to preserve the listed buildings, over new build on the site was overwhelming opposed. Andrew Richards presented a community proposal that was being prepared for the site

In conclusion they advised that in their opinion the applications should be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/6901000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/6901000)

**(d) Councillor Andrew Burns – Ward Councillor**

Councillor Burns, Ward Councillor for the Fountainbridge and Craiglockhart area advised that while significant changes had been made to the two previous plans not enough changes had been made to approve scheme three. It was noted that the proposed new build was greater in mass than all the listed buildings on site. Councillor Burns brought the Committees attention to the financial review and deficit appraisal carried about by Estates Services. The presentation re-iterated Scottish policy for planning with regard to 'enabling development' and stressed that this development did not meet that criteria.

In conclusion Councillor Burns requested that application no. 12/04007/LBC and application no. 12/04007/SCH3 be refused. Councillor Burns lodged no objection to the demolition of Learning Resource Centre (LRC) Building - application no. 12/04007/CON.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/9008000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/9008000)

**(e) Rosy Barnes – Friends of Craighouse**

Rosy Barnes, on behalf of Friends of Craighouse spoke against the application. The presentation began with a short video showing the Craighouse community and setting of the proposed development. The presentation listed the importance of Craighouse in the context of the seven hills of Edinburgh. A list of the policies of both the Scottish Government and City of Edinburgh Council that the proposed development contravened was shown. The uniqueness of the Craighouse site was stressed and the detrimental impact the proposed plans would have on the site were outlined. The criteria for 'enabling development' was discussed and criticism of the practice raised. It was advised that the proposed plans did not meet the criteria for 'enabling development'. A lack of assessment for the conservation deficit was stated and no

English Heritage guidelines applied to the financial case. The importance of greenspaces to the area and wider city was discussed along with the importance of trees within the area. The lack of a submitted maintenance plan from the developer was brought to the Committees attention. The uniqueness of the site was stated and the negative impact the development would have on the area was reiterate.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/9612000](http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/9612000)

**(f) Marion Williams – Cockburn Association**

Marion Williams from the Cockburn Association referenced that Edinburgh Skyline study and its praise of Craighouse. The presentation remarked that the proposal would not preserve or enhance the area and would be detrimental to the area. The ‘enabling development’ guidelines by the English Heritage Trust was highlighted. The possibility of a £500,000 grant from Heritage Scotland was raised. It was stated that commercial development would still be financially viable without the additional buildings. Questions were raised over the robustness of the developer’s figures and whether these should be the figures used for the ‘enabling development’ case.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/10807000](http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/10807000)

**(g) Ewan Leitch - Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland**

Ewan Leitch from the Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland accepted that there was scope for development within the sight however remarked that the current proposal was detrimental and not suitable for the landscape of the area. The novelty of ‘enabling development’ being used in planning within Edinburgh was raised. The architecture and impact on the site was criticised.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/11194000](http://www.edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/11194000)

**(h) Betty Barber – Craiglea Proprietors Association**

Betty Barber from the Craiglea Proprietors Association remarked the great interest of Craiglee in the area after Napier had sold the estate and it was the majority of Craiglea residents opinion that the proposed plan in scheme three was favourable to the area.

The presentation stressed the importance of having people and families back in the Craighouse area. Numerous criminal incidents were listed and security concerns raised. It was recognised that scheme three would bring conservation to the listed buildings and investment to the area.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be granted.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/11443000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/11443000)

**(i) Ian Murray – MP Edinburgh South Constituency**

Ian Murray MP remarked on the high level of public opposition to the development. Education, access and transport issues were raised and the extra burden that would be placed on the local services. The report was referenced and the number of detrimental issues it brought up. The presentation stated that there was no affordable housing in the proposed development and highlighted this as a departure of the affordable housing policies and was not combatable with the ‘enabling development’ case. Public trust in the planning system was raised and the function of local democracy within Edinburgh.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/13155000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/13155000)

**(j) Jim Eadie – MSP Edinburgh Southern**

Jim Eadie MSP, advised on the level of feedback he had received from local residents opposed to the development and opposed to the idea that the ‘enabling development’ case held up to scrutiny. The number of new builds on the proposed site was questioned as being excessive for a minimal development of new builds. Previous minimum build numbers from the last two schemes was referenced and the increase in greenspace was brought into doubt. Alternative uses for the site were discussed including a community ownership model. The presentation ended on four main points of opposition; that the enabling case had not been made; that planning and policy guidelines had not been met; that there were alternative uses for the site that are viable and the loss of greenspace as being too high a price to pay.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/13534000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/13534000)

**(k) Alison Johnstone – MSP Lothian**

Alison Johnstone highlighted the importance of Craighouse as being identified as one of only eight areas of greenspace significance. Remarked on the large number of proposed homes and how this would not conserve or enhance the area. Alternatives to the application were mentioned referencing the community proposal stated earlier in the hearing. The policies that the development contravened were outlined and the environmental impact on wildlife and trees was mentioned. Proof that this was the minimum amount of development was requested and community focussed alternatives were encouraged to be explored.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/13870000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/13870000)

**(l) William Gray Muir - Sundial Properties**

William Gray Muir representing Sundial Properties addressed the Committee with Andrew Munis - Montagu Evans and Richard Kevan - Wardell Armstrong. The experience in listed buildings restoration and conversion in which Sundial Properties had was highlighted and the significance of the site mentioned. The origins and history of the site was described and the active consent from 2007 stated. Challenges of the site were outlined including costs and practicalities. A key set of principals were listed which guided the development; the importance of the listed buildings; the landscape; public access needed to be central and quality of development not going after the lowest common denominator. The large amount of competing interests from key stakeholders was mentioned. The state of the buildings was described and the various levels of deterioration within the interiors. The importance of conserving these buildings was stressed. The developer described the number of changes across the two previous schemes and advised that this scheme was masterplan 48. Graphical representation photos of the site were provided to show the development in scale and context. The benefit to greenspace and the surrounding woodland was stated, along with commitments to improving the flooding problem in the area, and contributions to education and transport.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be granted.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/17412000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/17412000)



**(m) Councillor Melanie Main – Ward Councillor**

Councillor Main advised on the history of public access to the site. The criteria for 'enabling development' was described and its unsuitability for this development. Alternative proposals were outlined from community bids to alternative buyers. The minimum level of development was questioned and concerns were raised that this land and site would become private. The lack of a maintenance plan was highlighted as an issue and legal points were made within regard to public access to the land.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/21672000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/21672000)

**(n) Councillor Paul Godzik – Ward Councillor**

Councillor Godzik praised the improvement from the previous schemes however advised that he still had some concerns. The importance of the site was highlighted and the enabling case questioned. The harm to the heritage site was outlined and the purpose of the new proposals criticised.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/22474000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/22474000)

**(o) Councillor Mark McInnes – Ward Councillor**

Councillor McInnes questioned whether the policy breaches had gone too far. Highlighted the large number of policy breaches and the large number of detrimental impacts highlighted in the planning report. Councillor McInnes asked whether this was the best option for the site.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/22233000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/22233000)

**(p) Councillor David Key – Ward Councillor**

Councillor Key discussed the tests that planning officers apply to application to conclude whether they should be granted or refused. Councillor Key referred to the owners duty to conserve the listed buildings. The planning report was referenced and the large number of policy breaches that the report mentions. The strength of the enabling case was questioned and the developer's figures brought into question. Alternative uses were listed and a positive emphasis put on the community proposal previously heard. The democratic process was questioned and the high level of public opposition stated.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/22538000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/22538000)

**(q) Councillor Gavin Corbett – Ward Councillor**

Councillor Corbett highlighted the large number of policies contravened and questioned the enabling case. The minimum amount of development was criticised as not being accurate and offering a large profit to the developer. The alternative uses were outlined as viable alternatives with alternative business models.

In conclusion it was requested that the applications be refused.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start\\_time/22940000](http://www.edinburgh.public-tv/core/share/open/webcast/0/0/560/145532/145532/webcast/start_time/22940000)

**Motion**

To grant all three applications subject to conditions, informatives, a legal agreement and notification to Scottish Ministers as detailed in the reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Dixon

**Amendment**

- 1) To indicate the Sub-Committee's intention to refuse all three applications for reasons that the proposal did not constitute an enabling development and due to the unacceptable breaches of the policies outlined in the report by the Acting Head of Planning.
- 2) The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards to report further on the detail of the reasons for refusal

- moved by Councillor Howat, seconded by Councillor Bagshaw.

**Voting**

For the motion	-	9 votes
For the amendment	-	6 votes

**Decision**

To grant all three applications subject to conditions, informatives, a legal agreement and notification to Scottish Ministers as detailed in the reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

(Reference – reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

## Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

10.00 am Wednesday 10 September 2014

### Present:

Councillors Perry (Convener), Howat (Vice-Convener), Bagshaw, Blacklock, Brock, Child, Dixon, Heslop, McVey, Milligan, Mowat, Rose and Ross.

### 1. **General Applications and Miscellaneous Business**

---

The Sub-Committee considered the reports on planning applications and pre-applications, listed in Sections 4, 5, 6, and 9 of the agenda for the meeting.

### Decision

To determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to this minute.  
(Reference – reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted)

## APPENDIX

### Applications

Agenda Item No/Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p><b>Note:</b> Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decision are contained in the statutory planning register.</p>		
<p><a href="#">Item 4.1</a> <a href="#">11 Cumberland Street North West Lane, Edinburgh</a> <a href="#">(Land 17m West Of)</a></p>	<p>Development of 2 mews houses on existing car park and on garden ground to rear of 20C Fettes Row (as amended) (application no 13/05285/FUL)</p>	<p>To <b>CONTINUE</b> consideration of the application for a site visit.</p>
<p><a href="#">Item No 5.1</a> <a href="#">1 Abinger Gardens, Edinburgh</a></p>	<p>Application to create a gated opening and driveway in the garden to the side of the property with the opening and access from Murrayfield Gardens. The gate will be of metal frame and wood construction with a hard standing of recycled cobbles. (application no 14/02192/FUL)</p>	<p>To <b>REFUSE</b> the application for the reasons detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p><a href="#">Item No 5.2</a> <a href="#">1 Hillcoat Loan, Edinburgh</a></p>	<p>Application to erect a metal container type shed (application no 14/00389/FUL)</p>	<p>To <b>REFUSE</b> the application for the reasons detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>

<p><a href="#">Item 6.1</a> <a href="#">2 Sciennes Gardens,</a> <a href="#">Edinburgh</a></p>	<p>Proposal for single storey flat roof (with glass cupola) extension to rear of property. Install velux windows in existing roof. Form driveway hardstanding for off-street parking for one car.</p> <p>(application no 14/02148/FUL)</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> the application subject to the informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p><a href="#">Item No 9.1</a> <a href="#">62 Morrison Street,</a> <a href="#">Edinburgh</a></p>	<p>Report on forthcoming application by Britel Fund Trustees Ltd, C/O Homes Investment, C/O JLL for the demolition of the redundant Skyparks Car park Building and proposed development of new Grade A offices, multistory carpark to include re-location of Scottish Power Substation, public realm and associated works.</p> <p>(reference no 14/02838/PAN)</p>	<p>1) To note the key issues at this stage.</p> <p>2) Further information on:</p> <p>(i) The storage of trade waste</p> <p>(ii) Access to the development via the Chuckie Pend</p> <p>(iii) Public realm</p>